

Women-Run Church

(Continued from Page 1)

involve, as appropriate, qualified women in the planning and presentation of such conferences.

Point 15: "I ask the priests of the diocese to unite with me in a prayerful examination of our attitudes toward women and the ways in which we communicate with them. Through such a sharing I believe that we will strengthen our bonds of faith and affection and, at the same time, lessen the possibility of any unhealthy clericalism among us."

As of May 11, according to the administrators of the web site, cleansingfiredor.com, which meticulously documents the rise of Clark's lay-run womanchurch, there are five women religious in charge of 11 churches, including Sr. Joan Sobala, SSI, a key player in the Women's Ordination Conference, who runs two churches, St. Anne and Our Lady of Lourdes; Sr. Karen Dietz, SSI, who runs three churches, St. Agnes, St. Rose, St. Paul of the Cross; Sr. Chris Treichel, OSF, who runs two churches, Sacred Heart and St. Ann; Sr. Joan Cawley, SSI, who runs the Church of the Resurrection; and Sr. Diane Dennie, SSI, who runs three churches, St. Michael, St. John the Evangelist, and St. Patrick.

Six laywomen run 12 churches. Deb Housel is in charge of four churches, with "sacramental minister" Fr. Paul Gitau: St. Michael, Corpus Christi, St. Andrew, and Church of the Annunciation. A fifth church she ran, Our Lady of Perpetual Help, recently closed. Charlotte Bruney runs St. Vincent de Paul. Irene Goodwin runs St. Mary of the Assumption; Anne-Marie Brogan runs St. Mary, in downtown Rochester; Margaret Ostromecki runs two churches, St. Thomas More and Our Lady Queen of Peace; Barbara Swiecki runs three churches, Good Shepherd, Guardian Angels, St. Joseph. Meanwhile, two laymen run six churches: William Rajbohn runs St. Pius X and Michael Sauter has five parishes.

Another Women's Ordination Conference activist, Nancy DeRycke, is not now serving as a lay administrator but had done so for several years at Church of the Resurrection, St. Helen, St. Margaret Mary, and Good Shepherd.

"These lay administrators," *The Wanderer* was informed by the administrator of cleansingfiredor.com, "direct the pastoral care of their parishes. They are in charge and answer to the bishop. Priests assigned under lay administrators serve as 'sacramental ministers' or 'assisting priest' and are little more than sacramental Pez machines. The administrator calls all the shots, often delivers a homily, wears an alb, and sits in the sanctuary alongside the priest, stands up to deliver commentary during Mass, and some have even performed the preliminaries of Baptism. These administrators preside over parish council meetings in violation of canon law. And, of course, the administrators list their names at the top of parish bulletins."

Seven years ago, Bishop Clark spoke at Boston College's "The Church in the 21st Century Initiative," along with several women involved in the U.S. Bishops' *Pastoral Letter on Women* (which eventually failed to achieve approval), and after recounting the type of "inclusive" liturgy he admired, when women and men at the altar all had equal roles, he expressed his vision of the type of Church women want.

There are "six qualities" that women look for in the Church, he said.

"The first relates to how the Church formulates its proclamations and teachings and I would say under that category they have three strong desires: First, that their experience be heard and honored, not argued with, but absorbed and integrated into the thinking of those who hear. Secondly, that a broad spectrum of

voices should be heard before coming to conclusions that relate to teaching and polity of significance. They include specifically poor women and men, abused women, abandoned mothers, divorced women, gay, lesbian, single people, now thought to be absent from this kind of discourse, leaving us deprived of their experience and their insights. Thirdly in that basic theme that they seek to develop, a Church that is diverse and affirming of all, welcoming those who have been excluded, including varying theological perspectives, people whose backgrounds offer richness that clerics alone cannot possibly hope to have, and all manner of gifts and talents and life experiences. So, how the Church formulates its proclamations and teachings.

"Secondly, how the Church deals with diverse opinion among the faithful: They want a Church that deals with issues and people and divergent theological opinion in loving and just ways, rather than what may seem to be a condemnatory manner or a dictatorial kind of manner. Many long for a Church that affirms the gifts of all members as we struggle to form communities dedicated to loving one another and building the kingdom of God.

"Thirdly, on theological work that needs to be done in service of the Church women want: In terms of the theological tasks they're most concerned about they ask for the development of a more adequate theological anthropology, one that will adequately account for gender distinction in integrating our understanding of '*imago Dei*' and '*in persona Christi*.' With particular emphasis they stress the need for that kind of reflection and inclusion in matters of sex and sexuality which does not sufficiently include consideration of women's experience.

"Next, the exercise of authority in the Church: The general call is for a decentralized authority better able to serve the Church and the Gospel we seek to follow and embody. This includes a climate of honest and open dialog, granting to local churches — dioceses — the right to exercise their own identities, to call their own leaders, and respond pastorally to concerns and realities that arise in a given place and time and which may not be common to all places. Disagreement on matters other than creedal statements should not be feared, but a community of discourse in which truth is sought and celebrated should be encouraged and nourished.

"Fifth, on Church activity and action: The Church needs to consider its call to reach out to those in need and to grant increasing prominence to action on behalf of justice as a constitutive part of preaching the Gospel. . . . A Church that simply 'maintains' and leaders who focus on extraneous or superficial goals are in no way the Church that women want.

"Next, on the Church as a source of spirituality. . . [w]omen I have talked with expressed the need to approach the Church as a community whose rituals and celebrations are rich in the authentic tradition that nurtures life and genuine relationship with God. Under that rubric of spirituality in a Gospel-centered life, if we fail to image God in appropriate ways, if we cannot assume the role of pilgrim Church assisting the disciples of Christ in their call to be present to those bearing the fears and anxieties of our time, then we will have forsaken our call and our mission."

The Latest Woman To Leave

In the late summer and early fall of 1998, Bishop Clark received some international publicity when he was forced to take action against Fr. James Callan at the city's Corpus Christi Church.

Callan was blessing same-sex unions, concelebrating Mass with his assistant Mary Ramerman (who was later "ordained" a "priest"); he subsequently founded his own church and was excommunicated.

A number of women prominent in the Diocese of Rochester, starting with Gloria Ulterino, who for years ran Clark's Office of Women, have played prominent roles in advancing the "woman-church." Though Ulterino has not, officially, left the Catholic Church, she is active in the Women's Ordination Conference, and is the author of several liturgies which women can preside at. Other Catholic women in Rochester have been "ordained," such as Denise Donato, a graduate of St. Bernard's School of Theology and Ministry, who recently formed the St. Mary Magdalen community in suburban Fairport.

The latest woman to announce her departure from the Catholic Church is the music director at the Church of the Assumption — also

in Fairport — whose pastor, Fr. Ed Palumbo, serves on Clark's Priest Personnel Board.

On April 10, 2011, Fr. Palumbo announced that Mary Van Houten, who ran the music program at his parish for two and a half years, was leaving to "enter more deeply into ministry," i.e., had decided to become a priest.

"It is important for all of us to listen to the voice of God speaking within our hearts," the priest wrote. "Mary's discernment has led her to the conclusion that the Lord is calling her elsewhere for further discernment. As a result of this process, Mary has submitted her resignation as a member of our staff, effective at the end of June. This news is sad for us because Mary has brought the wonderful and powerful gift to the music ministry of our community. Our choirs are vibrant, our cantors and instrumentalists all offer the gift of their music beautifully and our whole parish has benefited from Mary's prayerfulness and spirituality. The quality of our sung prayer is a wonderful gift to our parish community and a 'joyful sound unto the Lord.' Mary has brought out the best in us!"

In a letter to parishioners, Van Houten was a little more specific. She wrote:

"For the past several years, I have sensed a deeper call from God in my life. In order to discern what this call might be, I sought the guidance and [counsel] of a few 'wise people.' These dear friends and spiritual directors who know and love me, helped me listen to God and discern how God was calling me. Their support and direction helped me to answer the tough questions that clarified God's call in my life.

"I have discerned that I am being called by God to the vocation of ordained ministry. As you know, the Roman Catholic Church does not embrace the vocation of the ordained ministry of women. Believe me, I am aware of every implication that this call demands, and have shed many tears. This call makes absolutely no sense, especially since it is contrary to what the Catholic Church professes and teaches. But what, my friends, am I to do? What does anyone do when they are summoned? With terrifying excitement, they follow and so I must follow where my good and loving God calls me. . . .

"I am convinced that without the support, love, and stability of Assumption Parish, I would never have had the 'spiritual space' in which to do this kind of discernment."

The current "Pastoral Associate" at Church of the Assumption is Deni Mack, one of the most prominent women in the diocese, who, along with Sr. Joan Sobala

and Nancy DeRycke, is affiliated with the Women's Ordination Conference. Mack, a former parishioner of ex-Fr. Callan's Corpus Christi, has preached at Assumption on various occasions, and is also one of the presiders at liturgies for Rochester's chapter of Dignity/Integrity, along with Gloria Ulterino.

The Bottom Line

Rochester blogger Rich Leonard posted, on April 25, 2011, an item titled, "Ten Reasons: Dying and Rising (but mostly dying)," in which he observed:

"In his latest randomly themed column for the *Catholic Courier*, Rochester Bishop Matthew Clark crows about winning an award for pastoral planning, remarking at the end that [t]here is a great deal of dying and rising in pastoral planning."

"The people of Rochester might be forgiven for thinking it's mostly been the former. For evidence, see my Amazon.com review of His Excellency's recent book on something called 'lay ecclesial ministry'."

"Potential readers should realize that Bishop Clark presides over perhaps the most dissent-filled, decadent diocese in the nation. His unique approach to lay ministry, which includes illicitly appointing two members of the Women's Ordination Conference as 'pastors' over parish clusters, has resulted in an unparalleled vocations crisis. (In the book, he flagrantly defends his elevation of dissenting would-be priestesses by claiming Lay Ecclesial Ministry 'has become a substitute ministry for the one to which they feel called.')"

"From 1995 to 2005, the Diocese of Rochester lost over 45% of its priests, a figure unmatched virtually anywhere in the United States. Indeed, priests aren't even priests in Rochester; they are called 'sacramental ministers' in local Catholic officialdom. And while Mass attendance has stabilized or increased in most parts of the Church in America over the last decade, it is in free-fall in Rochester, dropping almost 25% since 2002."

Meanwhile, the countdown to Clark's retirement ticks away: 430, 429, 428. . . .

Might we suggest that those readers who desire to see Bishop Clark's tenure abruptly canceled write to Marc Cardinal Ouellet, PSS, Prefect of the Congregation of Bishops.

· Mailing Address: Palazzo della Congregazione, 00193 Roma, P.le P.zza Pio XII, 10

· Telephone: 06.69.88.42.17

· Fax: 06.69.88.53.03

A copy of your letter should be sent to our Holy Father Benedict XVI.

Melkite Patriarch Says...

Don't Encourage Arab Revolutions

DAMASCUS, Syria (CNA) — Patriarch Gregorios III, the Syrian head of the Melkite Greek-Catholic Church, is warning Western leaders not to encourage the revolutions currently shaking up the Middle East.

"Our Arab countries are not ready for revolutions, and not even for democracy of the European kind and model," the patriarch explained in a recent letter to Western leaders. "I am asking the West not to encourage revolutions unconditionally here and there in the Arab world."

In the patriarch's native Syria, government forces have killed hundreds of protesters in response to continuing mass demonstrations.

The patriarch said "social, religious, and demographic" factors could cause instability and violence if regimes are toppled rather than reformed. He called for "evolution, not revolution," and said Western leaders should push for reforms.

"Ask the heads of state of Arab countries to work for real development, and demand a clear, bold plan," he stated. "But don't encourage revolutions!"

"Arab heads of state should be invited and encouraged to develop democratic structures, freedom, and respect for human rights," wrote Patriarch Gregorios, the spiritual leader of 1.6 million Melkite Catholics.

He said Arab leaders should also be "supported in promoting systems of medical and social welfare and housing," to ease economic difficulties that have fueled many of the revolutions.

The patriarch described Syria's own instability, characterized by mounting public protests and increasingly violent responses by

the government of President Bashar al-Assad, as a "tragic situation" for all concerned.

But he rejected the notion of overturning the government. Many Syrian Christians are not supporting the protests, fearing that a sudden end to the Assad regime would plunge the country into a sectarian power struggle comparable to the aftermath of the Iraq war.

"Already, the situation has deteriorated," Patriarch Gregorios observed, citing reports of "organized crime, robbery, fear, terror being spread, and rumors of threats to churches. . . . All this creates trauma."

Under its present government, Syria manages to keep a delicate balance between its Muslim majority and Christian minority, he said. The patriarch described the country as a "model of faithful and open secularism," and said the city of Damascus was "one of the most important cities in terms of Christian presence in the Arab world."

But this presence could come to an end if a sudden vacuum of power leaves Islamic extremists and others fighting to control the country. "Christians especially are very fragile in the face of crises and bloody revolutions," the patriarch said.

"Christians will be the first victims of these revolutions, especially in Syria. A new wave of emigration will follow immediately."

Patriarch Gregorios also asked the West to prioritize the Israeli-Palestinian peace process. He said the outcome of that project, which became stalled last year over the issue of Israeli settlements, would be decisive for the future of Christianity in the Middle East.

Fr. John T. Zuhlsdorf . . .

Vere dignum et iustum est, aequum et salutare, nos tibi semper et ubique gratias agere: Deo Patri qui nos creavit, Dominum nostrum. Per quem majestatem tuam laudant Angeli, adorant Dominationes, tremunt Potestates. Caeli caelorumque Virtutes, et beata Seraphim, socia exultatione concelebrentur, et nos quoque ut admitti jubeas, deprecamur, supplicii confessione dicentes:

What Does The Prayer Really Say?

The Second Eucharistic Prayer — Part 3

We continue our exploration of the new, corrected English translation of the Second Eucharistic Prayer. Last week we reviewed the Preface which comes with the Second Eucharistic Prayer. I repeated a mistake last week. In my rendering of the Preface I included, "O Holy Lord, Father Almighty, Eternal God" for the simple phrase "*sancte Pater*." It was haste and a cut-and-paste mistake, I'm afraid. We now dig into the text itself.

Vere Sanctus es
Latin Text (2002MR)

Vere Sanctus es, Domine, fons omnium sanctitatis. Haec ergo dona, quaesumus, Spiritus tui rore sanctifica ut nobis Corpus et Sanguis fiant Domini nostri Iesu Christi. Qui cum Passioni voluntarie traderetur, accepit panem et gratias agens fregit, deditque discipulis suis, dicens: Accipite et manducate ex hoc omnes: hoc est enim Corpus meum, quod pro vobis tradetur. Simili modo, postquam cenatum est, accipiens et calicem, iterum gratias agens dedit discipulis suis dicens: Accipite et bibite ex eo omnes: hic est enim calix Sanguinis mei novi et aeterni testamenti, qui pro vobis et pro multis effundetur in remissionem peccatorum. Hoc facite in meam commemorationem.

For *rore* look under the lemma *ros* in your never bedewed *Lewis & Short Dictionary*. *Ros* means "dew" and "any liquid falling in drops, moisture."

WDTPRS Literal Version:

Truly, O Lord, you are the Holy one, the source of all holiness. Therefore, we beseech You, sanctify these gifts by the dew of Your Spirit so that they become for us the Body and Blood of our Lord Jesus Christ. Who, when willingly He was about to be handed over to (His) Passion, took bread and, giving thanks, broke it, and gave it to His disciples, saying: All of you receive and eat of this: for this is My Body which will be handed over for you. After the supper was concluded, in a similar way taking also the chalice, again giving thanks He gave it to His disciples, saying: All of you receive and drink from this: for this is the chalice of my Blood of the new and eternal covenant, which will be poured out abundantly on your behalf and on the behalf of multitudes for the remission of sins. Do this for my remembrance.

For the following, I will add some **emphases** so that you can see more easily what the changes are. Try reading them aloud. The Roman Canon was always recited silently, until a few years ago. This Eucharistic Prayer was always said aloud. Note also the structure. First, there is an expression of honor for God which serves as an expression of thanksgiving, there follows an *epiklesis* or calling down of the Holy Spirit, and, next, we have the narrative of the institution of the Eucharist which we are commanded to renew.

Lame-Duck ICEL (1973):

Lord, you are *holy indeed*, the fountain of all holiness. Let your Spirit come upon these gifts to make them *holy*, so that they may become for us the body and blood of our Lord, Jesus Christ. Before he was given up to death, a death he freely accepted, he took bread and gave you thanks. He broke the bread, gave it to his disciples, and said: Take this, all of you, and eat it: this is my body which will be given up for you. When supper was ended, he took the cup. Again he gave you thanks and praise, gave the cup to his disciples, and said: Take this, all of you, and drink from it: this is the cup of my blood, the blood of the new and everlasting covenant. It will be shed for you and for all so that sins may be forgiven. Do this in memory of me.

New Corrected ICEL (Advent 2011):

You are indeed Holy, O Lord, the fount of all holiness. Make holy, therefore, these gifts, we pray, by sending down your Spirit upon them like the dewfall, so that they may become for us the Body and Blood of our Lord, Jesus Christ. At the time he was betrayed and entered willingly into his Passion, he took bread and, giving thanks, broke it, and gave it to his disciples, saying: Take this, all of you, and eat of it: for this is my Body which will be given up for you. In a similar way, when supper was ended, he took the chalice and, once more giving thanks, he gave it to his disciples, saying: Take this, all of you, and drink from it: for this is the chalice of my Blood, the Blood of the new and eternal covenant, which will be poured out for you and for many for the forgiveness of sins. Do this in memory of me.

At some point we will have to review the "*pro multis* . . . for many" issue, but for now, let's move forward.

I note with approval that the new, corrected translation renders *calix* as "chalice" rather than "cup," thus taking us beyond language ordinarily applied to kitchenware and Styrofoam. Some critics will object that Jesus would never have had a fancy *calice*. He was poor. Therefore we should use pottery at "liturgy" and say cup. On the other hand, the "upper room" where the Last Supper was held was the property of someone who more than likely had some means. He could have allowed the famous miracle-working rabbi to use his very best things for their special meal. Either way, two thousand years after the Last Supper, instructed and fortified by an ever-deep-

ening faith and love for the Eucharist, we should be aiming higher, rather than lower, when it comes to the consecrated at the Most Holy Sacrifice of the Mass.

I said "dew" for *ros* in that "*rore Spiritus*." There was a lot of controversy about this phrase during the translation process. Critics of the more literal approach thought "dew of the Holy Spirit" sounded strange and that it would be *too haard* for people to grasp. The new version has "dewfall," which is a pretty good choice. It retains the poetry of the original and harks to the ancient reflections on Scripture.

The coming of and effects of the Holy Spirit, in Scripture and in the Fathers of the Church, are often described not by fire imagery, but rather by water images and, indeed, dew. First, *ros* can come from above like rain. Second, *ros* is dew which forms nearly imperceptibly. In one case, rain flows across a thing and washes it. Dew slowly dampens. In both cases there results a penetrating soaking. Arid ground yields to planting. Seeds germinate and sprout. The *ros Spiritus* in our prayer can be both the cleansing and the moistening. Our Catholic doctrine of sanctification teaches us that at Baptism a person is both justified and *sanctified* by the washing/indwelling of the Holy Spirit. That sanctification can be deepened through the course of one's life. It comes suddenly. It comes gradually.

In Scripture the psalmist sings about the "King of Justice." "May he be like rain (Vulgate *ros*) that falls on the mown grass, like showers that water the earth!" (*Psalms* 72:6 RSV). In the Song of Songs, we hear, "Open to me, my sister, my love, my dove, my perfect one; for my head is wet with dew (*ros*), my locks with the drops of the night. By night I have put off my coat, how shall I put it on? I have washed my feet, how shall I defile them?" (*Cant.* 5:2-3). St. Augustine (+430) saw in the lover and beloved an image of Christ calling His ministerial Church to service. From Isaiah we have an image which has come into the Latin Church's liturgy, namely, "*Rorate caeli desuper*... Shower (*rorate*), O heavens, from above, and let the skies rain down righteousness; let the earth open, that salvation may sprout forth, and let it cause righteousness to spring up also; I the LORD have created it" (*Isaiah* 45:8 Vulgate and RSV — Introit Fourth Sunday of Advent).

The Fathers made much of *ros* through an allegorical technique of interpretation. Origen (+254), via Rufinus' translation of the *Homilies on the Book of Judges* (8.5), says: "But we also, if only we might offer our feet, the Lord Jesus is ready to wash the feet of our soul and cleanse them with a heavenly washing (*rore caelesti*), by the grace of the Holy Spirit, by the word of sacred doctrine." St. Ambrose of Milan (+397), who drew much upon Origen's writings as a starting point, in his work on the Holy Spirit wrote: "The Holy Scriptures were promising to us this rainfall (*pluvia*) of the whole world, which watered the orb under the coming of the Lord, in the falling dew of the divine Spirit (*Spiritus rore divini*)" (*De spiritu sancto* 1.8).

You might object that we are now in a Eucharistic, not baptismal context. Do not put from your mind your Baptism when thinking of the Eucharist! Only by Baptism can the priest receive Holy Orders. Only by Baptism can we receive Confirmation and the Body and Blood of Christ at Mass.

The aforementioned Ambrose, in *On the Holy Spirit* 13-16, offers a rich commentary pertinent to today's portion of the Eucharistic Prayer. As you read, keep in mind the humility of God the Son on the night of His betrayal in that first instance of the mystery of Transubstantiation:

"Let us come now to the Gospel of God. I find the Lord stripping Himself of His garments, and girding Himself with the towel, pouring water into the basin, washing His disciples' feet. This water was heavenly dew (*ros*) itself. . . . Let the feet of our minds now be stretched out. The Lord Jesus wants to wash our feet also. Indeed He says, not to Peter alone, but to each of the faithful: 'If I will not have washed your feet, you will have no share with Me.' Come, then, Lord Jesus, put off from Yourself the garments which you put on for my sake! Be bare, that you may clothe us with Your mercy! Gird the linen towel around Yourself for our sake, so you might gird on us an immortality of Your giving. Pour the water into the basin. Wash not only our feet but also the head, not the soles of the body alone but also of the mind! I wish to put off all the uncleanness of our frailty so that I also may say: 'By night I have put off my coat, how shall I put it on? I have washed my feet, how shall I defile them?'"

"How great this majesty is! Like a servant (*minister*) You wash the feet of Your servants (*famuli*), as God You send dew (*ros*) from heaven. Nor do you only wash feet, but also You invite us to be at the table with You, and You exhort us with the example of your esteem, saying: 'You call Me Lord and Teacher, and you do well, for so I am. If, then, I the Lord and Teacher washed your feet, you then, wash one another's feet.'"

"I, therefore, wish, I also, to wash the feet of my brethren, I want to fulfill the Lord's command. He wanted that I not be shy, nor scornfully refuse what He Himself did first. Good is the mystery of humility, because while I wash the uncleanness of others I wash away my own. . . . Let Your distillations come unto me and the dew trickling immortal grace."

This is something to keep in mind when the new translation comes into use and you hear "dewfall."

+ + +

WDTPRS aims to help you know and love more deeply the true content of the prayers of Holy Mass. Get these articles faster with an online subscription (thewandererpress.com). Send e-mail feedback to frz@wdtprs.com. Send letters in care of *The Wanderer*. Visit the blog: wdtprs.com. Follow Fr. Z on Twitter: @fatherz.

Tradition

(Continued from Page 1)

use of Latin and Gregorian Chant in parishes, to emphasize the "very close and organic bond" between "the renewal of the liturgy and the renewal of the whole life of the Church."

Pope Benedict urged members of the Pontifical Liturgical Institute to continue serving the Church "with renewed enthusiasm" in the coming years, "in full fidelity to the rich and valuable liturgical tradition and to the reform desired by Vatican Council II," especially the "magisterial directives" of *Sacrosanctum Concilium*.

Great Lectures! — Free Downloads! — Enjoy!

InstituteofCatholicCulture.org

In season and out of season, presenting the Faith; in all its magnificent history its philosophical truth; and its timeless art.